



The personal is political: a feminist reflection on a journey into participatory arts-based research with sex worker migrants in South Africa

Elsa Oliveira

To cite this article: Elsa Oliveira (2019) The personal is political: a feminist reflection on a journey into participatory arts-based research with sex worker migrants in South Africa, *Gender & Development*, 27:3, 523-540, DOI: [10.1080/13552074.2019.1664047](https://doi.org/10.1080/13552074.2019.1664047)

To link to this article: <https://doi.org/10.1080/13552074.2019.1664047>



Published online: 29 Oct 2019.



Submit your article to this journal [↗](#)



Article views: 21



View related articles [↗](#)



View Crossmark data [↗](#)



The personal is political: a feminist reflection on a journey into participatory arts-based research with sex worker migrants in South Africa

Elsa Oliveira 

ABSTRACT

This article offers a personal reflection of my journey into participatory arts-based research with sex work migrants in South Africa. It begins by sharing some background information of how my own experience as a migrant woman, and my layered (sometimes conflicted) identities, have continued to shape and influence much of my scholarly work, including my commitment to engaging in research that supports (or at least tries to support) social justice. Through this article, I offer an example of how the ‘personal is political’ is entwined in feminist values of research and engagement. Those who experience the issues under investigation must be considered equal partners in research processes. Collaborative forms of knowledge production can support social justice, particularly if efforts strive to shift the centre from which knowledge is traditionally generated and disseminated.

Cet article propose une réflexion personnelle sur mon voyage au cœur de la recherche participative basée sur l’art avec des travailleurs du sexe migrants en Afrique du Sud. Il commence par présenter des informations de base sur la manière dont ma/mes propre(s) expérience(s) en tant que migrante, ainsi que mes identités superposées (et parfois en conflit) ont continué d’éclairer et d’influencer une grande partie de mes travaux de recherche, y compris mon engagement à prendre part à des recherches qui soutiennent la justice sociale. À travers cet article, je cherche à illustrer que le slogan « le privé est politique » est intimement lié aux valeurs féministes de recherche et de dialogue. Ceux qui font l’expérience des questions examinées doivent être considérés comme des participants égaux et à part entière aux processus de recherche. Les formes collaboratives de production de connaissances peuvent soutenir la justice sociale, en particulier si les efforts cherchent à modifier le point central à partir duquel les connaissances sont traditionnellement générées.

En este artículo ofrezco una reflexión personal sobre las implicaciones que provocó en mí el contacto con una investigación participativa basada en el arte, realizada con mujeres migrantes que ejercen trabajo sexual en Sudáfrica. Así, comienzo compartiendo cómo mis antecedentes, mis propias experiencias como mujer migrante y mis varias (y a veces conflictivas) identidades siguieron formando parte e influyendo en gran medida mi trabajo académico, lo que incluye mi compromiso de participar en investigaciones que respalden la justicia

KEYWORDS

Feminist research; participatory research; arts-based research; public engagement; migration; sex work; South Africa

social. A través de este artículo quiero ejemplificar cómo la afirmación de que lo "personal es político" se encuentra entrelazada con los valores feministas de investigación y participación. Quienes experimentan los problemas a los que se alude en cualquier estudio, deben considerarse participantes plenos e iguales en los procesos de investigación. Las formas colaborativas de producción de conocimiento pueden apoyar la justicia social, en particular si los esfuerzos en este sentido intentan cambiar el centro desde el cual tradicionalmente se genera el conocimiento.

Introduction

Personal experiences of research are generally not encouraged in traditional academic writing, but are nevertheless an essential, even mandatory component to taking an empathetic stance in our research relationship. As Ramona Beltran and her colleagues' project at the University of Denver, 'Our Stories, Our Medicine'¹ shows us, storytelling is critical to the tapestry of our lives. The process of creating and sharing stories is a transformational tool for reclaiming knowledge and highlighting resiliencies despite legacies of colonisation, imperialism, patriarchy, and other forms of oppression. Arts-based research approaches are one way to learn cultural knowledge(s) and create new knowledge simultaneously. As Leeat Granek, who advocates for the epistemology of the hyphen, explains, our very beings are constructed and developed in an inter-subjective exchange with the people we work with (Granek 2013, 191).

Indeed, during my years of research with migrants and sex workers in South Africa, I have learnt that what I most enjoy about the research process is the opportunity to learn by listening, and the possibility of making a difference through active witnessing. In my opinion, feminist and participatory research traditions facilitate communication and exchange, and have values that extend beyond simply expanding academic knowledge. We should, therefore, not treat academic work as constitutively distinct from activist work, but rather conceptualise research processes as political practices (Osterweil 2013).

In this article, I look at how less-traditional research approaches like my own can be used to generate more respectful research, engagement, and dissemination *with* rather than *on* migrants working in the sex industry (Oliveira 2018a). I focus on the potential in particular of participatory arts-based research approaches. When used responsibly and ethically, these methods offer a possibility for re-visioning and representing complex lives in ways that are not always possible through descriptive linear language or 'top down' traditional approaches. In this article, I explore and reflect on the experience of using less-conventional research methods, and frame them in a personal – and political – account of starting a journal into feminist research.

Located between spaces, lost in translation? My journey into research

Being a researcher requires feminists to consider how their own identities, locations, and life experiences shape the ways we see the world, and the understandings and meanings we

give to the people, themes, and concerns in our research. For example, migration is a global phenomenon that has shaped and influenced almost every aspect of my life, from birth to present. I am an Angolan-born woman who grew up in East San Jose, California. I speak four languages, but my first is Portuguese. When my family arrived on the sunny shores of the Bay Area in 1976, my parents were in their mid-forties and I was just a toddler.

Growing up as a migrant: straddling multiple cultures and identities

My experiences of growing up in the heart of the Silicon Valley, in a neighbourhood made up almost entirely of first-generation migrants, resonates strongly with what Chicano-feminist, Gloria Anzaldúa (1987), describes as living in the 'Borderlands': spaces that are not entirely physical nor completely abstract; spaces where multiple identities, histories, cultures, and ideologies overlap and collide. On the one side were (and still are) vibrant (sometimes conservative) migrant traditions, cultures, and values, and on the other, was/is 'white America', an idea (and a system) that simultaneously called upon me in as much as it pushed me away.

Negotiating my cultural and migrant identities, while also seeking to forge new identities, has remained to this day anything but simple. Like the migrant women, men, and transgender persons who participate in my research, I straddle many worlds – the global and local, rural and urban, modern and 'traditional', and I even have roots in different countries. I am a queer woman in a hetero-patriarchal world, and I hold different identity documents, none of which really represent where 'home' is for me, or where I imagine it to be someday. I am vehemently opposed to the politics of the Catholic Church, yet there are times that I find solace in my religious upbringing and its iconography. I moved from my parents' house not because I was getting married but because I wanted to study, an act of defiance in my community that is often celebrated, but also chastised.

Layers of history, culture, and ideology shape the socially constructed and imagined frontiers between my many worlds. These borders – both material and immaterial – are sources of hope and creativity as well as despair and despondency. Gloria Anzaldúa describes the reasons for this hybridity as being 'cradled in one culture, sandwiched between two cultures, and straddling all three and their value systems' (1987, 52). Located between spaces, and in many ways without a place, I constantly construct and deconstruct myself away from a Western purity of identity, to one of many things and nothing. This living 'between and betwixt' (Turner 1969, 94) flows through my work. Who I am, my history, and my experiences interact and relate to the subject matter under investigation in ways that have impact on my research and the relationships that I form.

Language, translation, self-expression, and belonging

Language and translation are key issues for me, both in my personal and professional life. When I travel back 'home', to San Jose, California, childhood friends sometimes tell me that I speak like a 'white girl' – a harsh reminder that I no longer easily belong in 'that' world. Yet, there are times when I am around some of my academic colleagues that I

feel paralysed by my insecurities because English is not my first language and my hands move all over the place when I speak, and I wonder if I will ever feel as though I belong in 'this' world.

My dad spent most of his life in the USA, working as a greens keeper at Stanford University, alongside other migrant workers, mainly from the Azores (Portugal) and Mexico. Due to the similarities of Portuguese and Spanish, his day-to-day language needs were mostly met. My mom, on the other hand, cleaned the homes and altered the clothes of affluent Americans. Her English is beautiful. I love the thickness of her accent; the ways she uses and makes words, how she inserts pauses, and blends all of the languages that she speaks into a cacophony of sound and gestures. Sometimes I wish I had her accent, a way to affirm undeniably that I am from many places.

Although both of my parents attended English classes for years, they struggled to absorb the new language. So, just like many other migrant kids all over the world, the responsibility of translation fell upon my shoulders at a very young age. Lost in translation, I often stumbled (as I still do) to move between languages. When expressing my own thoughts and emotions, it is often difficult to find the words that adequately convey what I think with how my heart feels, in a way that others might understand. I prefer to use all the languages that I speak together, all at once, but this is not always possible. When it is, I feel liberated. In many ways, my research with sex worker migrants in South Africa is a representation of my own relationship with language. It is an intentional mediation between sentiments of knowing and acts of making, where raw noises are turned into script.

Speaking for others: rejecting 'neutrality' and recognising privilege

I can hardly remember a time before being involved in some kind of social justice work. Whether translating for my parents, mentoring youth in state custody, or facilitating women's self-defence classes in my early twenties, I have always been motivated by a desire to support positive social change.

Before beginning my postgraduate studies at the African Centre for Migration & Society (ACMS), an interdisciplinary research centre at the University of the Witwatersrand in Johannesburg, South Africa, I spent nearly 20 years working in various social work capacities. I was a crisis line advocate for a sexual assault support services non-profit organisation, a care provider for people with physical disabilities, a college advocate to first-generation high school students, and a case manager in various mental health settings. Although each role presented unique responsibilities and challenges, my desire was (and always been) to support micro-level experiences while advocating for macro-level change.

During these years, there were times that I was given the awkward task of speaking *for* students and families, such as during disciplinary hearings and meetings with school officials. These moments were incredibly important. Sometimes they facilitated better psychosocial support services, the release of state custody, or access to free college education. Speaking on behalf of anyone is, however, an incredibly complicated and delicate task, no

matter how old one is or how much experience one has gathered over the years. As many have noted, what we think is never neutral (hooks 2000a); and what we might consider ‘common sense’ is actually informed by a range of cultural backgrounds, power structures, and judiciary realities (Ahmed 2017). Being cognisant of the ways in which our privileges might influence our thinking is always important, but it is especially critical when those we are ‘telling stories’ about have realities that are markedly different than our own (Mohanty 2003).

Listening to the stories of sex workers

The stories of sex workers have become a focus for me as a researcher, together with their struggles for social justice. Too often sex workers’ stories (and their demands) are ignored, or are analysed from the point of view of criminality or health disorders (Agustín 2007). But when their stories are heard and analysed from a feminist social justice perspective, very different kinds of research and knowledge are produced.

My initial exposure to issues of sex work, and the stories of sex workers, dates back to my early twenties, in the early 1990s. At that time, I had friends who were either working, or had worked, in the sex industry. Their narratives, like those of the women, men, and transgender persons involved in my current research, were layered and often fragmented. Experiences of abuse and violence were almost always recounted alongside tales of friendship, pleasure, and solidarity. Their reasons for entering sex work also varied – from being the sole family provider to needing to support alcohol and drug addictions, from poverty and not being able to find work in other sectors due to irregular documentation statuses to wanting to explore and express their genders and sexualities in diverse ways.

Regardless of their individual trajectories, however, all described their involvement in sex work as entrepreneurial: they took risks to earn good money. These friendships have influenced my thinking surrounding issues of sexual commerce, and, like Wendy Chapkis, being queer makes me wary of a ‘strategy calling for the arrest and punishment of any party to consensual adult activity’ (1997, 3).

Although many of my friends have kept their occupation hidden from family and friends, a few publicly celebrate their involvement in the sex industry. But the stories that I was hearing were, however, noticeably absent in popular media, political discourse, and academic literature. Like many other feminists around the world, I believe that unless those whose lives are being debated are included in the debates, our understandings will always be incomplete, if not dangerously superficial (Dlamini and Shackleton 2016). This conviction comes from nearly four decades of witnessing and *feeling* the devastating consequences of biased and prejudiced narratives, and discriminatory policies making it more difficult for some people to participate in social, economic, and political processes (Dutta 2016).

In my current research, I ask what sex workers’ stories about their lived experiences, needs, and aspirations can tell us about sexual commerce. I took my first steps down this path of enquiry in 2010, when I began my postgraduate studies at the ACMS. Before arriving in Johannesburg, the only thing I knew for certain was that I wanted to study migration, but the issues facing sex workers soon caught my attention.

Polarised views of migrant sex work: the stories that are told

In South Africa, issues of sex work were (and still are) hostile and polarised (Yingwana 2018), with some groups claiming that sex work should be decriminalised entirely, and others insisting on various forms of criminalisation, such as criminalising all aspects of sex work (the current legal framework), criminalising the selling of sex, criminalising the buying of sex, or criminalising pimping or owning a brothel (Nyangairi and Palmary 2014).

In January 2010, when I arrived in Johannesburg, South Africa was preparing to host the first ever FIFA World Cup on the continent. As the country prepared to host this multi-billion-dollar sporting event, the philosophical tensions around sex work gained increased public and political attention, due in part to a resurgence of global anti-trafficking discourses up against an increasingly vocal (and visible) worldwide sex workers' rights movement (Gould 2010).

Although there was (and still is) a lack of corroborating evidence proving a link between mega-sporting events and human trafficking for sexual exploitation (Walker and Oliveira 2015), international journalists and anti-trafficking advocates alike began to lambast the notion that thousands of women were going to be trafficked into South Africa in order to meet the (supposed) sexual demands of nearly half a million football fans (Richter and Delva 2011). Narratives of horror, promoted through radio programmes, across newspaper headlines, and on the television, gave rise to popular anxieties about the possible connections between the World Cup and trafficking (Palmary 2016). Included in these efforts was also the development of highly manufactured images depicting the tied-up hands, gagged mouths, and bruised faces of (mostly) black women, with the words 'save', 'rescue', 'innocent', 'bought', or 'sold' that were splattered on billboards all across country. Similar media hype had accompanied the 2006 World Cup in Germany (Lowenberg 2006) and, more recently, surrounded the 2016 Summer Olympic Games in Brazil (Murray *et al.* 2018).

Behind this melodramatic imagery and the agendas of international organisations run by global elites is a view of poor women 'on the move' as being particularly fragile and vulnerable creatures, unable to make decisions on their own behalf (Vance 2012). International and national agencies (funded mostly by donors in the global North) invested large sums of money in the rolling out of massive anti-trafficking awareness. Not only did the anti-trafficking campaigners seek to solicit public support for 'the cause', they also aimed to promote the idea that everyone engaged in sex work was/is a victim of trafficking (Bonhuys 2012).

Selling sex is illegal in South Africa, and I found myself wondering what sex workers – the majority of whom are also internal or cross-border migrants (Richter *et al.* 2014) – thought of the advocacy surrounding sex work and trafficking that was largely taking place without their direct input (Nyangairi and Palmary 2014). I wondered if a better understanding of sex workers' complex and multifaceted lives might help to bring their experiences from the margins to the centre (to borrow from bell hooks 1984). I also wondered if and how research might better support what Nigerian novelist, poet, and social

critic, Chinua Achebe (2000), describes as the need for a 'balance of stories', meaning that those who are often written about should also be able to contribute to the making of their own stories and definitions of themselves and of their worlds.

Nine years later, these are still the questions that sit at the heart of my on-going research with migrants and sex workers in South Africa.

Research with sex worker migrants in South Africa

Building on previous sex worker research conducted in partnership with the ACMS (e.g. Richter *et al.* 2014), my initial study, entitled 'Working the City: Experiences of Migrant Women in Inner City Johannesburg',² involved an adapted photovoice methodology and collaboration with the Sisonke National Sex Worker Movement³ (South Africa's sex worker-led movement), the Market Photo Workshop⁴ (MPW), a Johannesburg-based photography school with extensive experience conducting community-based photography projects, and the ACMS, an internationally recognised interdisciplinary research centre. The participatory study drew on lessons learned from a previous community-based project undertaken in partnership with the MPW (Vearey 2010) and involved the direct participation of 11 migrant women who lived and worked as sex workers in Hillbrow, the most densely populated suburb of Johannesburg.

Unlike traditional photovoice approaches where participants are given disposal cameras and limited instructions on how to use them, the Working the City participants were lent digital cameras and received basic photography training. The women were also given journals to document whatever aspects of their lives they wished to explore through visual and narrative forms of expression (Oliveira and Vearey 2015). An established photographer with previous experience conducting community-based projects facilitated the workshop, which ran for 11 consecutive weekdays. The first nine days focused on teaching participants how to use their cameras, brainstorming key issues they wanted to document or explore, and daily group discussions of images captured (Oliveira 2016). During the final two days of the workshop, each participant selected ten of their own images, including a self-portrait, along with accompanying captions and a short narrative that they wrote for public audiences.

The project commenced in August 2010, one month after the FIFA World Cup had ended (Oliveira and Vearey 2017a). Given the fervour of debate and the timely nature of the project, it might come as no surprise that the visual and narrative artefacts (photo-stories) produced by the 11 women received media attention. *Their* visual and narrative stories not only confront popular assumptions that everyone engaged in sex work needs and/or wants to be rescued, they (and the making of them) have also opened up multiple spaces for critical dialogue and reflection (Oliveira 2015).

Since the official opening in August 2011, the Working the City exhibition – 12 A1 posters, one of each participant and one explaining the project – has travelled all over the globe, and researchers and the media are still requesting images (Oliveira 2016). These requests, and the unanticipated visibility of the project, clearly revealed the need for

more diverse representations of migrants and sex workers in South Africa and elsewhere (Oliveira and Vearey 2017a).

The strengths and lessons learned from Working the City has since informed various iterations of participatory arts-based research at the ACMS, including additional projects involving partnership with Sisonke. Some of these collaborative endeavours include the 2013–2014 Volume 44 project, often referred to as the second iteration of photo-voice work with sex worker migrants in South Africa (see Oliveira 2016). Other ACMS/Sisonke projects include: Equal Airtime, a body mapping and narrative writing project with sex workers in the Limpopo province, that was first displayed during the 16 days of activism against gender-based violence (see Oliveira 2018b); the ongoing *Izwi Lethu: Our Voices* newsletter project, which began in 2015 (see Schuler and Oliveira 2018); the Sex Worker Zine Project, which took place in two South African provinces: Limpopo and Mpumalanga (see Oliveira and Vearey 2016), and Bua Modiri,⁵ a recently completed poster project with sex worker migrants from various South African provinces.

The MoVE (method.visual.explore) project

Working the City, and other participatory arts-based projects conducted in partnership with the ACMS and civil society organisations also inspired Dr Jo Vearey, Senior Researcher and Director of the ACMS, and myself, a postdoctoral researcher at the same institution, to launch the MoVE (method:visual:explore) project⁶ to explore ways of doing research differently.

Established in 2013, the MoVE project is premised on the belief that research should be driven by a strong social justice agenda, with a commitment to developing ways to co-produce and share knowledge through public engagement (Oliveira and Vearey 2017b). The MoVE approach aims to integrate social action with research, and involves collaboration with migrant participants, existing social movements, qualified facilitators and trainers, and research students engaged in participatory arts-based methods, such as photography, narrative writing, theatre, film, collage, and poetry. Creative approaches to research not only open up intellectual and practical spaces for sharing, learning, and making, they can also validate the experiences and knowledge(s) of everyone who participates. As Caroline Kihato (2009) explains, an exploration of marginalised population groups requires a methodology that not only validates how people understand, explain, and represent their lives and experiences, but also foregrounds their words, their self-representations, and signifying practices. Arts-based research makes use of diverse ways of knowing and experiencing the world. In fact, what distinguishes arts-based research and related methodologies, such as visual sociology and image-based inquiry, are ‘the multiple creative ways of representing experiences and the different representational forms (medium) of expression that can effectively enhance understandings of a human experience’ (Capous-Desyllas and Morgaine 2017, xv). Central areas of investigation in MoVE projects relate to issues of migration, with a specific focus on gender, sexuality, health, well-being, and policy.

As the excerpt below highlights, Jo and I established MoVE as a result of our collective commitment to exploring and developing a research practice that engages with and recognises our subjective experiences and personal histories. Jo Vearey, a British-born woman, now permanent South African resident, initially travelled to Johannesburg for six weeks in 2003 and has remained ever since. Both of us found our way to South Africa through unanticipated journeys that eventually resulted in each of us undertaking doctoral studies at Wits University in Johannesburg (Oliveira and Vearey 2017a). As we recently wrote:

The entanglement of our individual migratory, academic, and research trajectories represent ongoing journeys across challenging terrains: into and within academia, and between and across academic, government, civil society, and public spaces. While our disciplinary backgrounds and respective personal and professional experiences differ (as do those of all involved in facilitating and running MoVE projects), the multiple synergies present allow us to work together, and with others, to collaboratively develop and test approaches to research that strive to examine, and address, the complex systems of power and privilege across multiple platforms, including within scholarly, political, and public spaces. We are committed to exploring the ways in which research processes can be conceptualised and utilized as spaces for social justice engagement, involving ourselves as participants within the process. Doing so, however, requires that we continuously acknowledge and critically reflect on our position(s) in the world: in our own complexity of what it means to have a human experience; what it means to have power and privilege in some spaces, while navigating liminality and marginalisation in others. The process of production that typify the MoVE approach to research attempt to engage with these concerns. (Oliveira and Vearey 2017a, 268–9)

The MoVE project aims to: involve collaboration with migrant groups that are typically excluded, under-represented, or misrepresented in research, policy, and public debates; explore ways that knowledge can be co-produced between researcher(s) and participant(s); and share outputs created during research processes (Oliveira and Vearey 2016). To date, MoVE projects have involved partnership with migrants residing in informal settlements (Vearey 2010); with Somali migrants and refugees (Ripero-Muñiz and Fayad 2016); with lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender (LGBTQ+) asylum seekers (Dill *et al.* 2016; Oliveira *et al.* 2015); with migrant women in inner-city Johannesburg (Walker and Clacherty 2014; Oliveira and Walker 2019); and with migrant women, men, and transgender persons involved in sex work and sex worker activism (Huschke 2017; Schuler *et al.* 2016). These, and other MoVE projects, have culminated in a range of research and advocacy outputs, including public exhibitions, newsletters, engagement with officials, and the development of free downloadable ebooks⁷ that archive projects and workshop processes.

Working the borders

My academic work has always drawn great inspiration from anti-oppressive and decolonised ways of thinking about research and the process of making and sharing knowledge (Chilisa 2012). This means that I approach research, first and foremost, through a love ethic: I strive to deepen participants' involvement in the research process while remaining firmly committed to work that encompasses social justice, diversity, civic discourse, and caring (Finley 2003). A love ethic also means that I make a 'choice to connect' (hooks 2000b, 3),

to ‘find myself in others’, and to challenge the arbitrary lines that have been drawn between researchers and participants. I strive to live and work the borders: between and betwixt institutions and communities, systems of power and systemic injustice, cultures of dominance and cultures in survival mode, politics and theory, theory and practice (Tuhivai Smith 1999). In other words, my work is rooted in notions of ‘personal is political’ – an acknowledgement that personal experiences and emotions, such as ‘rage’ (Bennett 2010), ‘love’ (hooks 2000b), and ‘feelings’ (O’Neil 2001) are sites for the construction of knowledge.

As a queer feminist researcher, I am interested in exploring collaborative forms of knowledge production and, it is critical, I argue, that those who experience the issues under investigation be included in research processes. Not only does their direct inclusion in research allow for a more nuanced understanding of complex phenomena, it also offers a space in which critical consciousness can be developed (Maguire 2001). Collaborative research partnerships that position those who are often the subjects/objects of research as experts of their own lives also respond to the resounding call from sex workers across the globe, and the motto of Sisonke: *Nothing About Us Without Us*.

The arts-based projects with sex worker migrants that I have been involved with have all been motivated by a desire to move beyond highly emotive discourses and towards more nuanced understandings of those living the debates. They also seek to support social justice by shifting the centre from which knowledge is traditionally generated; an approach that coheres ontologically and epistemologically with both feminist and participatory research traditions (Maguire 2001).

Participatory research strategies are based on critical social science theories, where the primary aim is not only practical, but also about ‘jointly producing knowledge with social movements’, whereby ‘critical interpretations and readings of the world are accessible and understandable to all involved’ (Chatterton *et al.* 2007, 218). Feminist scholarship does not share a single or monolithic method, methodology, or theoretical base; rather, there are competing theoretical foundations and varied methodologies (Maguire 2001). Feminists have also not agreed on a single definition of research; but what we all do share is a call for structural transformation and personal action (Oliveira 2018a). My research, then, combines feminist critiques of androcentrism (a male-centred worldview) with participatory research’s emphasis on inclusion and social change to explore the diverse lived experiences of migrants who sell sex in South Africa. The inclusion of different arts-based techniques – photovoice, zines (small circulation of self-published works), narrative writing, poetry, body mapping, or posters – has allowed sex workers to speak for themselves, from their multiple and varied standpoints.

Over the years, I have strived to co-produce knowledge with participants and I have sought to explore ways in which research designs can be conceptualised to include the development of outputs that participants can use for their own purposes. As Susan Dewey and Tiantian Zheng write:

We as researchers have obligations toward individuals who participate in our research and put our obligations into action through practice of reciprocity with those who help us with our research. (Dewey and Zheng 2013, 52)

The adapted photovoice projects *Working the City* (2010–11) and *Volume 44* (2013–14) included a public engagement component, such as public exhibitions and publications. But the cost of printing and curating a space to hang the posters has made them expensive to reproduce, especially for a grassroots organisation like Sisonke (Schuler and Oliveira 2018). Addressing this limitation was a priority for the research team during the design and conceptualisation stages of subsequent MoVE projects involving ACMS and Sisonke collaboration. As Susan Finley explains, ‘[s]ocially responsible research for and by the people cannot reside inside the lonely walls of academic institutions’ (2008, 74). The *Izwi Lethu* newsletter, zine, and poster projects were envisioned to produce outputs that could be cheaply printed and easily distributed – forms of public engagement that an organisation like Sisonke can sustainably fund and circulate. Although it was ACMS researchers who brought the idea of newsletters, zines, and posters to Sisonke, the two organisations worked together to plan each project.

Efforts to expand research engagement beyond academia are particularly important in studies with sex workers because the public’s collective knowledge of the sex industry in South Africa, and globally, is largely informed by stereotypes and sensationalised media representations (Dutta 2016). Even feminists, the steadfast protectors of women’s rights, are divided on the issue of commercial sex, often hashing out theoretical extremes that rarely reflect the realities of those whose lives are most impacted (Walker 2016). Some feminists argue that the legalisation or decriminalisation of sex work only serves to normalise and institutionalise the sexual exploitation of women (Bindel 2017), whereas other feminists, including sex worker activists, assert that criminalisation is itself a form of oppression, one that only serves to further stigmatise women, making it more difficult and dangerous for them to make a living (Dlamini and Shackleton 2016). Each side of the debate makes assumptions about women’s agency.

While I find both sides of the argument compelling, I also agree with Gail Pheterson (1996), who argues that victimisation and agency are not mutually exclusive. A person may at times be victimised in their quest for greater agency and at other times be compelled to make a ‘transgressive’ decision in an attempt to escape and/or survive constraints (Katsulis 2008). Positioning sex worker migrants as experts of their own lives can help move away from polarised thinking and, instead, shed light on the social, economic, and political constraints within which sex workers’ agency is exercised and played out (Mgbako 2016). A focus on sex workers’ subjective lived experiences and self-representations is especially critical in light of popular assumptions found globally (now being pedalled by the media) that all trafficking is sex work and all sex work is trafficking (Doezma 2010). While human trafficking can result in numerous kinds of forced labour, sexual exploitation is often focused on and sensationalised (Andrijasevic 2010).

Participation and audability

My research with sex worker migrants in South Africa is:

Motivated by a politically driven desire to do what sex workers often charge non-sex worker researchers like myself with failing to do: to listen to their own accounts, to not judge or prejudge, to pay attention to what they are saying, and to 'give back' in ways that include finding platforms where their self-produced stories can be shared and disseminated. (Oliveira 2018a, 5)

This feminist, participatory approach to knowledge production grants epistemic privilege to those who take part in my research. Not only has this unveiled insights that seep far beyond prevailing discourses that depict sex workers as only ever vulnerable, 'at risk', and/or as victims of trafficking, it has also created spaces where the re-telling of life stories validate realities that are often elusive, hidden, and/or silenced (Oliveira 2018a).

Over the years, participants have responded positively to their involvement in MoVE projects. Many have built new friendships and developed stronger circles of sex work solidarity with their peers. Other participants describe being able to learn a new skill and having dedicated time to reflect on their lives as most beneficial. At the end of project workshops, participants often share their desires for more opportunities to tell, create, and listen to stories. As Teresa, a Volume 44 participant, said during an interview: 'Now I want to tell many stories. Better stories than the one I created. I look at the world so different now' (December 2014).

In addition to sharing testimonies of pride in the works they create for public audiences, participants have also stressed the importance for sex workers to speak for themselves. According to Kagee, a regular contributor to the *Izwi Lethu* newsletter: 'No one knows our lives better than we do and we need to tell our stories so that people know the truth and not just ideas about our lives' (February 2015). Ikeltlang, a Working the City participant, believes that the confidence she gained during the project is what led to her appointment as the Sisonke Gauteng Provincial Coordinator, shortly after the project ended. For other participants, their involvement offered them the opportunity to learn more about sex workers rights, to explore their genders and sexualities, and to work through feelings of shame and stigma (Oliveira 2018b). As Meme, a Bua Modiri participant, recently said: 'Talking and thinking together before we make posters taught me too many things about what sex workers are facing and it show me that I am not alone' (May 2019).

Participants are always given the freedom to explore and choose the stories/messages they want to share with public audiences. While some are consistent with those they talk about during workshops, others dilute, modify, and/or completely alter their public works. Some also change their pseudonyms before releasing their selected stories to public audiences or during one-on-one interviews, as additional steps to protecting their anonymity (Oliveira 2016).

Calls for the decriminalisation of sex work, safe access to public health-care services, and the right to live and work with dignity are often shared by participants at the onset of their involvement in a project. For some participants, however, these (and other) issues become more pronounced as workshops progress over time. As Mimi, a Working the City participant, explained:

We spend so many days talking and I felt my voice get stronger. I am not ashamed of who I am but I must also keep my work private because of stigma and fear that my family will not approve and

disown me. In the workshops, I could be open about my life and the things that hurt and pain me. This made me stronger inside. I don't want to feel bad things about me because I do this job to feed my kids. No one tell us what to say in the project. Each person chooses and it makes us to feel proud, like we can do so many things that no one thinks we can. (October 2010)

Ongoing requests for the use of sex worker generated stories by the media, researchers, and civil society clearly reveals the importance of work produced by (rather than 'on' or 'about') those whose lives are under constant scrutiny. Participants' near-perfect attendance, and their desires for more opportunities, also highlight the need for more collaborative research with sex workers and migrants in South Africa and elsewhere. While there are many benefits to using participatory arts-based approaches with marginalised population groups, it is also important to note that all research is embedded in layers of power dynamics that can never be fully addressed, no matter how inclusive methods and/or studies strive to present.

For centuries, research has been just another form of colonisation, with outsiders 'giving voice' to their 'less-powerful' participants (Tuhiwai Smith 1999). Collaborative research partnerships, such as those described here, may help to increase participants' agency in the research process by disrupting hierarchies of power (Milne 2016), but it would be incorrect to assume that the mere inclusion of participants in research automatically resolves power imbalances. Even when participatory methods are used, the rules that govern research designs and implementation often remain the preserve of researchers (Dutta and Sircar 2018).

Funders and civil society partners can also significantly shape the research processes. This includes informing the types of questions we ask, expected outcomes, and resulting outputs. Efforts to support social justice, then, not only require that we remain astutely aware (and critique) the socioeconomic and political forces influencing our work and lives, but that we also interrogate the various roles that academia and intellectuals (including ourselves) play in sustaining and perpetuating dominant forms of knowledge (Moletsane *et al.* 2015).

Final thoughts

Experiences of erasure and exclusion are not new for marginalised communities. Indeed, some of the most prevalent and harmful stereotypes currently circulating in the media, and in public and political discourses, are about migrants and sex workers. As a queer, migrant woman who has experienced (and witnessed) erasure in various forms, the bitter sting of having one's complexities invalidated or reduced to a fit a narrative that makes others feel better is all too familiar.

My decision to use participatory arts-based methods in my research comes from the belief that the volition of sex workers can be best illustrated by sex workers themselves. This theoretical and practical approach seeks to shift the control over representation, from those in positions of power to those whose standpoints are seldom acknowledged. By firmly locating my research in the context of South Africa, I also contribute to a counter-narrative that confronts the disempowering and one-dimensional depiction of 'third-

world prostitutes' that are often the focus of anti-sex work activists' saviour impulses (Mgbako 2016).

Criminal laws on sex work are paternalistic. They have not, nor will they ever, eradicate the industry. All they do is make it more difficult for sex workers to mitigate danger, and their risks are compounded by migration status, sexual orientation, gender non-conformity, and unsafe working conditions (Oliveira 2017; Richter *et al.* 2014). The need for sex work law reform is made poignantly clear in the visual and narrative stories produced by the sex worker participants for public audiences.

Although all research exists in a complicated web of power and elitism, I believe that the 'arts' offer alternative ways of thinking, analysing, and representing knowledge in ways that traditional methods are unable to convey. The public works produced by the women, men, and transgender persons involved in my research make 'visible' the lives of a population group that are often represented by how 'outsiders' perceive them. They offer everyone involved (researchers, participants, and wider publics) an opportunity to learn more about the issues facing sex workers and migrants and they provide an opportunity to move beyond categories that divide us so that we might consider ways to 'love' differently, through and beyond research.

While there is no doubt that the participants' words and images inject vital knowledge (s) into the world, equally important, if not more important, is the process that accompanied their making. It is difficult to put into words everything that goes into MoVE projects. Besides logistical preparations, such as submitting ethics clearance applications, planning workshop days, organising meals, and finding venues, the process also involves less-tangible, more-ephemeral aspects. MoVE projects are a collage, a tapestry of different people, moments, gestures, ideas, feelings, and contradictions: encounters that are experienced, sometimes all at once, as simultaneously silencing and deafening (Oliveira and Walker 2019). The process is the anticipation of starting a new project, meeting new people, and stumbling with the not knowing what to do or say at times. It is the WhatsApp messages that are exchanged long after a project ends, the bits of paper, caulk, and glitter that cover the workshop floor, and the spontaneous eruptions of laughter, dance, and chatter. It is the workshop walls covered in participants' artwork, the themes generated, and random thoughts and observations that are recorded on large pieces of paper. The process is also the anger and frustration that comes and goes, and the music that plays in the background while everyone is working. It is watching someone summon up the courage to speak in front of their peers about something that matters to them, something that happened, and watching participants listen and offer support to one another. It is also about being flexible with workshop schedules so that the needs of participants can be accommodated, and it is holding the research team accountable for the safety and care of everyone who takes part in a project. The process is the celebrations that take place when exhibitions open, when participants' see their public works for the first time displayed for everyone to see, read, and witness. It is about making sure that participants have a say in the ways they are represented, and how the research unfolds, but also at the same time, it is about recognising that it may not be equitable to assume that participants have the same investment or interest in research and/or its significance and value.

Similar to the feelings of dissonance that I experience when translating for my parents or when speaking on behalf of those with whom I work, I am often left with a sense that language fails, especially when attempting to explain layered moments and complex lives. The words that we have available to us are often inadequate to the task of conveying conflicting messy identities, the longing for loved ones and places, systematic humiliation, love, hopes, pain, struggles, and dreams. In some ways, it is this ‘failure’ of language that the arts help bridge. In its various forms, art provides mediums for self-reflection, self-expression, and communication between and among creators and audiences (Finley 2008). When used responsibly and ethically, arts-based methods can facilitate empathetic responses and horizontal channels of learning; both of which are critical to dismantling oppression and advancing social justice. It is, however, critically important that researchers address potential risks identified in the literature, particularly when seeking to increase the audibility/visibility of marginalised population groups, such as sex worker migrants. It is also so important that researchers document their research experiences and that we share them with one another. Our very beings are, after all, entangled in our work.

Notes

1. For more information, see <https://socialwork.du.edu/research/project/our-stories-our-medicine-archive> (last checked 17 July 2019).
2. For a detailed description of Working the City, see Oliveira (2016) and Oliveira and Vearey (2015).
3. The Sisonke National Sex Worker Movement was launched in 2003. Its core mission is to advocate for the decriminalisation of sex work in South Africa and to offer sex workers a platform where they can voice (and share) their everyday experiences, needs, and aspirations. For more information, see www.sweat.org.za/what-we-do/sisonke/ (last checked 2 September 2019).
4. The MPW was founded in 1989 (during apartheid) by world-renowned photographer and anti-apartheid activist, David Goldblatt. Since then, MPW has continued to play a pivotal role in the training of South Africa’s photographers, ensuring that visual literacy reaches neglected and marginalised South Africans. For more information, see <https://marketphotoworkshop.co.za/> (last checked 2 September 2019).
5. Read about the Bua Modiri workshop process by visiting the project website: <https://buamodiri.wordpress.com/> (last checked 2 September 2019).
6. For more information, see www.mahpsa.org/arts-based-research/move/ (last checked 2 September 2019).
7. Copies of the ebooks are available at <https://issuu.com/move.methods.visual.explore> (last checked 2 September 2019).

Acknowledgements

My sincere appreciation goes to the participants who took part in the projects described in this article. Without their generosity, courage, and wisdom this work would never have come into being. I would like to acknowledge Jo Vearey for her ongoing support; Greta Schuler for her commitment on the *Izwi Lethu: Our Voices* newsletter project, and Quinten Edward Williams for sharing his expertise of the arts with me. Finally, I would like to thank the Sisonke National Sex Worker Movement, the Market Photo Workshop, and everyone else who made these projects possible.

Notes on contributor

Elsa Oliveira is a postdoctoral fellow at the African Centre for Migration & Society (ACMS), where she also co-coordinates the MoVE (methods:visual:explore) project. Postal address: African Centre for Migration & Society, P.O. Box 76, Wits 2050, Johannesburg, South Africa. Email: elsa.alexandra.oliveira@gmail.com

ORCID

Elsa Oliveira  <http://orcid.org/0000-0003-2367-5708>

References

- Achebe, Chinua (2000)** *Home and Exile*, Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press
- Agustín, Laura (2007)** *Sex at the Margins: Migration, labour markets and the rescue Industry*, London and New York: Zed Books
- Ahmed, Sara (2017)** *Living a Feminist Life*, Durham, NC: Duke University Press
- Andrijasevic, Rutvica (2010)** *Migration, Agency and Citizenship in Sex Trafficking*, London: Palgrave Macmillan
- Anzaldúa, Gloria (1987)** *Borderlands/la frontera: The New Mestiza*, San Francisco: Aunt Luke Books
- Bennett, Jane (2010)** 'The politics of writing', *Agenda* 16(46): 3–12
- Bindel, Julie (2017)** *The Pimping of Prostitution: Abolishing the sex work myth*, London: Palgrave Macmillan
- Bonthuys, Elsje (2012)** 'The 2010 football World Cup and the regulation of sex work in South Africa', *Journal of Southern African Studies* 38(1): 11–29
- Capous-Desyllas, Moshoula and Karen Morgaine (eds.)** *Creating Social Change Through Creativity: Anti-Oppressive Arts-Based Research Methodologies*, Cham, Switzerland: Palgrave Macmillan
- Chapkis, Wendy (1997)** *Live Sex Acts: Women performing erotic labor*, New York: Routledge
- Chatterton, Paul, Duncan Fuller and Paul Routledge (2007)** 'Relating action to activism: theoretical and methodological reflections', in S. Kindon, R. Pain and M. Kesby (eds.) *Participatory Action Research Approaches and Methods: Connecting people, participation, and place*, London: Routledge, 216–23
- Chilisa, Bagele (2012)** *Indigenous Research Methodologies*, Thousand Oaks, CA and London: Sage Publications
- Dewey, Susan and Tiantian Zheng (2013)** *Ethical Research with Sex Workers: Anthropological Approaches*, New York: Springer
- Dill, LeConte, Jo Vearey, Elsa Oliveira and Gabriella Martínez Castillo (2016)** 'Son of the soil ... daughters of the land: Poetry writing as a strategy of citizen-making for lesbian, gay, and bisexual migrants and asylum seekers in Johannesburg', *Agenda* 30(1): 85–95
- Dlamini, Dudu and Sally-Jean Shackleton (2016)** 'Sex work activism in South Africa: a struggle for visibility', in P. G. Macioti and Giulia Garafalo Geymont (eds.) *Sex Work Speaks. Who Listens?*, Open Democracy Press, 70–4, http://un-act.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/02/BTS_Sex_Workers_Speak-1.pdf (last checked 2 September 2019)
- Doezma, Jo (2010)** *Sex Slaves and Discourse Masters: The Construction of Trafficking*, London and New York: Zed Books
- Dutta, Debolina (2016)** 'Rethinking care and economic justice with third-world sex workers', in Wendy Harcourt (ed.) *The Palgrave Handbook of Gender and Development*, London: Palgrave Macmillan, 186–200
- Dutta, Debolina and Oishik Sircar (2018)** 'Notes on unlearning: our feminisms, their childhoods', in Rachel Rosen and Katherine Twamley (eds.) *Feminism and the Politics of Childhood: Friends or Foes*, London: UCL Press, 83–90

- Finley, Susan (2003)** 'Arts-based inquiry in QI: Seven years from crisis to guerrilla Warfare', *Qualitative Inquiry* 9(2): 281–96
- Finley, Susan (2008)** 'Arts-based research', in J. Gary Knowles and Ardra L. Cole (eds.) *Handbook of Arts in Qualitative Research*, Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage
- Gould, Chandre (2010)** 'Moral panic, human trafficking and the 2010 Soccer World Cup', *Agenda* 85: 31–44
- Graneek, Leeat (2013)** 'Putting ourselves on the line: The epistemology of the hyphen, intersubjectivity and social responsibility in qualitative research', *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education* 26(2): 178–97
- hooks, bell (1984)** *Feminist theory: From margin to centre*, Cambridge, MA: South End Press Classics
- hooks, bell (2000a)** *Feminism is for Everybody*, London: Pluto Press
- hooks, bell (2000b)** *All About Love: New Visions*, New York: HarperCollins Publishers
- Huschke, Susan (ed.) (2017)** *Know My Story*, Johannesburg, South Africa: MoVE/ACMS
- Katsulis, Yasmina (2008)** *Sex work and the City: The Social Geography of Health and Safety in Tijuana, Mexico*, Austin: University of Texas
- Kihato, Caroline (2009)** 'Migration, gender and urbanisation in Johannesburg' (Doctoral dissertation), Pretoria University of South Africa
- Lowenberg, Samuel (2006)** 'Fears of world cup sex trafficking boom unfounded', *The Lancet* 368(9530): 105–107
- Maguire, Patricia (2001)** 'Uneven ground: feminisms and action research', in Peter Reason and Hilary Bradbury (eds.) *Handbook of Action Research: Participative Inquiry and Practice*, London: SAGE, 59–69
- Mgbako, Chi (2016)** *To Live Freely in this World: Sex Worker Activism in Africa*, New York: New York University Press
- Milne, E.-J. (2016)** 'Critiquing participatory video: experiences from around the world', *Area* 49(4): 401–04
- Mohanty, Chandra (2003)** *Feminism Without Borders: Decolonizing Theory, Practicing Solidarity*, Durham, NC: Duke University Press
- Moletsane, Relebohile, Louise Haysom and Vasu Reddy (2015)** 'Knowledge Production Critique and Peer Review in Feminist Publishing: Reflections from Agenda', *Journal of South-North Cultural and Media Studies* 29(6): 766–84
- Murray, Laura, Ana Paula da Silva, Angela Donini and Cristiane Oliveira (2018)** 'Shifting gazes and challenging discourses about sex work and mega-events in Brazil', in Susan Dewey, Isabel Crowhurst and Chimaraoke Izugbara (eds.) *Routledge International Handbook of Sex Industry Research*, Abingdon, Oxon and New York: Routledge, 500–14
- Nyangairi, Barbara and Ingrid Palmay (2014)** 'Watching each others' back, coping with precarity', in Ingrid Palmay, Brandon Hamber and Lorena Núñez (eds.) *Healing and Change in the City of Gold*, Cham, Switzerland: Springer International Publishing, 122–34
- Oliveira, Elsa (2015)** 'MoVE (methods.visual.explore): exploring the use visual and narrative approaches with marginalised populations in South Africa', *Refugee Review Journal* 1: 34–48
- Oliveira, Elsa (2016)** 'Empowering, invasive or a little bit of both? A reflection on the use of visual and narrative methods in research with migrant sex workers in South Africa', *Visual studies* 31(3): 260–78
- Oliveira, Elsa (2017)** 'I am more than just a sex worker but you have to also know that i sell sex and it's okay: lived experiences of migrant sex workers in Johannesburg', *Urban Forum* 28(1): 43–57
- Oliveira, Elsa (2018a)** 'Volume 44: Research with migrant sex workers in South Africa', *Agenda* 32(2): 3–16
- Oliveira, Elsa (2018b)** 'Equal airtime: body maps and narrative stories by sex workers in South Africa', *Development* 1(2): 114–19
- Oliveira, Elsa and Jo Vearey (2015)** 'Images of place: visuals from migrant sex workers in South Africa', *Medical Anthropology* 34(4): 305–18

- Oliveira, Elsa and Jo Vearey** (eds.) (2016) *The sex worker zine project*, Johannesburg, South Africa: MoVE/ACMS
- Oliveira, Elsa and Jo Vearey** (2017a) 'Making research and building knowledge with communities: examining three participatory visual and narrative projects with migrants who sell sex in South Africa' in Moshoula Capous-Desyllas and Karen Morgaine (eds.), *Creating Social Change Through Creativity: Anti-Oppressive Arts-Based Research Methodologies*, Cham, Switzerland: Palgrave Macmillan, 265–89
- Oliveira, Elsa and Jo Vearey** (2017b) 'Beyond the single story: creative research approaches with migrant sex workers in South Africa', *Families, Relationships and Societies* 6(2): 317–21
- Oliveira, Elsa and Rebecca Walker** (2019) *Mwangaza Mama*, Johannesburg: MoVE/ACMS
- O'Neil, Maggie** (2001) *Prostitution & Feminism: Towards a Politics of Feeling*, Malden, MA: Polity Press
- Osterweil, Michal** (2013) 'Rethinking public anthropology through epistemic politics and theoretical practice', *Cultural Anthropology* 28(4): 598–620
- Palmry, Ingrid** (2016) *Gender, Sexuality and Migration in South Africa: Governing Morality*, Cham, Switzerland: Palgrave Macmillan
- Pheterson, Gail** (1996) *The Prostitution Prism*, Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press
- Richter, Marlise and Wim Delva** (2011) *Maybe it Will be Better Once this World Cup has Passed: Research Findings Regarding the Impact of the 2010 Soccer World Cup on Sex Work in South Africa*, Pretoria South Africa: United Nation Population Fund (UNFPA)
- Richter, Marlise, Matthew F. Chersich, Jo Vearey, Benn Sartorius, Marleen Temmerman and Stanley Luchters** (2014) 'Migration status, work conditions and health utilization of female sex workers in three South African cities', *Journal of Immigrant and Minority Health* 16(1): 7–17
- Ripero-Muñiz, Nereida and Salym Fayad** (2016) 'Metropolitan nomads: a journey through Jo'burg's "little Mogadishu"', *Anthropology South Africa* 39(3): 232–40
- Schuler, Greta** (2016) 'At your own risk: Narratives of migrant sex workers in Johannesburg', *Urban Forum* 28(1): 75–88
- Schuler, Greta and Elsa Oliveira** (2018) 'Something about us for us: Exploring ways of making research with sex workers in South Africa', in: Susan Dewey, Isabel Crowhurst and Chimaraoke Izugbara, *Routledge International Handbook of Sex Industry Research*, Abingdon, Oxon and New York: Routledge, 196–228
- Schuler, Greta, Elsa Oliveira and Jo Vearey** (eds.) (2016) *Izwi Lethu: Our Voices*, Johannesburg, South Africa: MoVE/ACMS
- Tuhiwai Smith, Linda** (1999) *Decolonized Methodologies*, London: Zed Books
- Turner, Victor** (1969) *The Ritual Process: Structure and Anti-structure*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press
- Vance, Carole** (2012) 'Innocence and experience: Melodramatic narratives of sex trafficking and their consequences for law and policy', *History of the Present* 2(2): 200–18
- Vearey, Jo** (2010) 'Hidden spaces and urban health: Exploring the tactics of rural migrants navigating the city of gold', *Urban Forum* 21(1): 37–53
- Walker, Rebecca** (2016) 'Selling sex, mothering and keeping well in the city: Reflecting on the everyday experiences of cross-border migrant women who sell sex in Johannesburg', *Urban Forum* 28(1): 1–15
- Walker, Rebecca and Glynis Clacherty** (2014) 'Shaping new spaces: An alternative approach to healing in current shelter interventions for vulnerable women in Johannesburg' in Ingrid Palmry, Brandon Hamber and Lorena Núñez (eds.) *Healing and Change in the City of Gold New York*, Cham, Switzerland: Springer International Publishing, 31–58
- Walker, Rebecca and Elsa Oliveira** (2015) 'Contested spaces: Exploring the intersections of migration, sex work and trafficking in South Africa', *Graduate Student Journal of Social Science* 11(2): 129–53
- Yingwana, Ntokozo** (2018) 'I'm not a feisty bitch, I'm a feminist: Feminism awake!', *Feminist Africa* 22: 186–94